

John Heenan
Bishop & Heenan
3970 Ave. D, Suite A
Billings, Montana 59102
(406) 839-9091
john@bishopandheenan.com

Roger Sullivan
McGarvey, Heberling, Sullivan & McGarvey, P.C.
745 South Main Street
Kalispell, Montana 59901-5341
(406) 752-5566
rsullivan@mcgarveylaw.com
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA
BILLINGS DIVISION

SIERRA CLUB and MONTANA	)
ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION	)
CENTER,	)
	)
Plaintiffs,	)
	)
vs.	)
	)
PPL MONTANA LLC, AVISTA	)
CORPORATION, PUGET SOUND	)
ENERGY, PORTLAND GENERAL	)
ELECTRIC COMPANY,	)
NORTHWESTERN CORPORATION,	)
PACIFICORP,	)
	)
Defendants.	)

APPENDIX A to Complaint
Opacity Violations

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - First Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/2	8:54
1/8	11 :18
1/10	7:42
1/10	8:30
1/10	8:42
1/10	17:36
2/24	16:06
3/2	0:36
3/2	4:24
3/2	4:30
3/2	7:48
3/3	20:48
3/7	0:48
3/7	6:48
3/7	15:48
3/14	12:54
3/17	1:00
3/17	1:18
3/17	1 :24
3/17	4:48
3/18	20:06
3/23	23:12
3/31	4:24

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/4	15:12
1/14	20:42
1/29	19:54
2/5	8:54
3/1	3:54
3/19	3:48
3/30	0:06
3/31	13:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - First Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/18	23:42
1/18	23:48
1/24	16:06
2/2	12:12
2/4	6:30
2/4	7:06
2/7	14:00
2/11	14:24
2/12	20:18
3/16	15:12
3/28	23:48
3/30	6:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/2	8:36
1/22	19:36

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Second Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/4	2:54
4/5	13:36
4/5	13:54
4/5	14:06
4/5	14:18
4/7	1:12
4/9	9:54
4/10	3:12
4/12	0:30
4/14	2:42
4/23	1:30
4/23	9:48
4/25	22:18
4/25	22:30
4/25	22:36
4/29	5:30
4/29	5:42
5/3	9:18
5/4	0:06
5/5	14:36
5/8	21:18
5/8	21:24

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Second Quarter 2008	
5/15	0:48
5/15	0:54
5/15	1:00
5/15	4:36
5/21	7:36

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Second Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/6	15:54
4/7	16:54
4/8	23:30
4/24	7:36
4/24	7:42
4/26	21 :48
6/19	16:36
6/19	16:42
6/20	12:06
6/20	12:12
6/20	12:18
6/20	15:00
6/20	15:30
6/21	21:30

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Second Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
5/22	1:24
5/22	1:36
5/22	22:18
6/7	11:00

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Second Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
5/26	7:48
5/26	7:54
5/26	11:24

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Fourth Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/9	12:00
10/9	12:54
10/9	13:06
10/11	22:48
10/15	12:12
10/22	1 :36
10/22	1 :48
10/26	5:00
11/1	17:00
11/1	17:06
11/5	9:12
11/5	9:18
11/13	15:54
11/17	2:12
12/5	11:48
12/10	8:42
12/10	10:00
12/13	7:18
12/13	8:24
12/27	23:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Fourth Quarter 2008	
--	--

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Fourth Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/3	21:54
10/3	22:00
10/3	22:06
10/3	22:12
10/6	12:06
10/11	23:54
10/12	0:12
10/31	4:36
11/8	4:00
11/8	16:48
11/8	16:54
11/12	9:18
11/12	9:42
11/14	7:12
11/14	7:36
11/14	10:54
11/20	12:36
12/17	11:12
12/17	11:18
12/17	16:18
12/21	8:48
12/21	9:00
12/21	13:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
11/7	16:36
11/7	16:42

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2008	
11/7	16:54
11/7	17:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Fourth Quarter 2008	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/4	4:18
12/2	3:12
12/25	15:06
12/25	15:12
12/25	19:18
12/29	9:06
12/29	9:12
12/29	9:18
12/29	9:24
12/29	9:30
12/29	9:42

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - First Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/4	2:06
1/13	2:12
1/13	14:12
1/13	14:18
1/23	18:24
1/23	18:36
1/27	13:48
2/6	8:36
2/12	18:48
2/14	7:36
2/17	4:48
2/19	8:42
2/19	17:18
2/25	2:24
2/25	2:30
2/26	1:54
2/26	18:54
2/26	19:06
2/26	19:12
3/9	20:42
3/9	20:48
3/14	2:06
3/14	16:54
3/26	6:24

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/2	18:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2009	
1/2	18:24
1/2	18:30
1/2	18:54
1/5	0:54
1/5	1:00
1/5	1:06
1/5	3:54
1/7	17:36
1/7	19:12
1/22	3:00
1/31	3:00
2/4/9	18:06
2/23	2:18
3/7	3:12
3/21	1:48
3/21	1:54
3/21	4:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - First Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
3/6	16:42
3/6	21:06
3/6	21:12
3/6	21:48
3/7	1:00
3/19	8:24
3/23	4:18
3/26	7:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2009	
2/11	16:24
2/21	22:48
3/5	20:36
3/5	20:48
3/5	20:54
3/5	21:42
3/5	21:48
3/5	21:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Fourth Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/21	3:18
10/23	22:18
10/23	22:36
10/23	22:42
10/23	23:00
10/25	22:42
10/30	0:00
10/30	0:12
10/30	0:18
10/30	0:24
11/24	2:18
12/11	0:36
12/12	2:54
12/12	3:36
12/15	7:42
12/22	10:54
12/29	8:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Fourth Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/1	17:54
10/10	1:48
10/10	2:24
10/10	2:42
10/10	20:36
10/11	1:48
10/23	1:48
10/23	2:06
10/31	1:54
11/4	15:12
11/12	4:48
11/12	23:48
11/20	6:30
11/24	0:30
12/2	8:54
12/2	9:00
12/3	12:36
12/13	7:00
12/20	19:30
12/20	19:36
12/22	20:24
12/27	17:36
12/28	23:12
12/29	8:36

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/18	21:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2009	
10/18	21:54
10/19	16:36
11/21	15:48
11/30	3:12
12/20	0:12

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Fourth Quarter 2009	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/27	22:18
10/27	22:36
10/30	9:48
10/30	10:48
10/30	11:06
11/28	14:36
12/31	23:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - First Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/1	8:30
1/7	22:30
1/9	3:00
1/16	3:54
1/24	2:06
1/24	4:00
2/22	2:00
2/22	2:06
2/25	10:48
2/26	8:06
2/26	8:42
2/26	11:06
2/27	3:18
3/20	12:06
3/21	17:30
3/21	17:42
3/21	22:54
3/22	1:18
3/22	1:24
3/22	1:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/2	9:12
1/5	1:24
1/6	1:00
1/10	14:06
1/14	13:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2010	
1/16	20:24
1/28	15:12
2/13	8:06
2/20	16:30
2/20	16:36
2/20	16:42
2/23	10:54
3/7	16:54
3/9	0:48
3/9	1:12

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - First Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/3	15:24
1/8	0:48
1/8	0:54
2/11	11:48
2/24	16:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/3	14:12
1/3	15:30
1/25	13:54
2/19	12:00
2/19	12:30
3/4	13:18
3/4	13:24
3/6	18:12
3/7	12:36

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Second Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/3	1:54
4/3	2:00
4/3	2:06
4/4	2:24
4/4	3:00
4/13	5:36
4/27	0:00
5/5	21:42
5/7	7:00
5/11	10:54
5/13	18:54
5/17	1:00
5/22	22:54
6/23	4:30
6/23	5:48
6/23	8:30
6/24	8:36

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Second Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
5/10	18:48
5/10	18:54
5/13	18:54
5/24	15:30

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Second Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/5	8:00
4/5	8:06
4/5	8:12
4/9	21:30
4/27	21:24
5/5	9:12
5/7	17:36
5/7	17:42
5/7	17:48
5/7	17:54
5/7	18:06
5/7	18:12
5/13	19:30
5/13	19:36
5/25	15:42
5/25	15:48
5/31	12:48
6/8	8:12
6/12	11:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Second Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/10	7:30

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Second Quarter 2010	
4/19	23:54
5/10	9:54
5/18	10:30
5/30	13:30
5/30	13:36
6/22	16:36

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Third Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
7/10	1:48
7/10	8:00
7/11	6:30
7/11	6:48
7/11	7:12
7/11	7:18
7/13	0:54
7/13	11:12
7/22	0:06
7/23	14:36
8/5	23:30
8/8	17:54
8/8	18:30
8/12	1:54
8/17	0:18
8/17	0:54
8/17	1:00
8/23	1:42
9/15	0:42
9/22	17:24
9/26	2:00
9/26	2:12
9/26	2:24
9/26	2:48
9/26	2:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Third Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
8/28	2:18
9/1	21:54
9/7	13:30
9/20	15:48
9/21	16:30
9/25	5:54
9/25	21:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Third Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
7/17	6:48
7/30	22:36
8/14	4:24
8/15	3:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Third Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
7/5	18:30
8/26	6:18
8/29	19:36
9/8	10:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
11/2	23:00
11/5	13:48
11/6	1:48
11/6	2:00
11/7	1:48
11/13	3:00
11/14	12:48
11/14	12:54
11/16	0:48
11/16	0:54
11/16	1:06
11/16	7:36
11/20	2:54
11/21	10:54
11/21	11:06
11/21	11:12
11/21	11:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
11/21	11:24
11/25	17:00
11/26	1:48
12/1	20:54
12/1	21:12
12/16	22:30
12/20	15:30
12/25	18:30
12/25	18:36
12/27	5:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/6	17:48
10/13	10:36
11/7	0:30
11/7	0:36
11/11	3:48
11/11	3:54
11/15	5:54
11/16	1:06
11/17	10:00
11/18	1:06
11/24	18:54
11/26	3:12
11/26	3:18
11/26	3:36
12/3	1:12
12/3	1:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
12/3	1:30
12/3	1:36
12/5	11:30
12/5	14:00
12/22	16:18
12/24	22:30
12/24	22:36
12/24	23:42
12/25	3:00
12/25	3:06
12/26	20:48
12/30	23:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/24	20:18
11/2	20:54
11/3	12:36
11/5	5:54
11/10	1:30
11/10	1:36
11/12	1:18
11/12	1:30
11/12	10:12
11/12	10:18
11/12	11:12
11/12	11:18
11/12	11:24
12/8	

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
	19:12
12/26	0:42
12/26	0:48
12/26	0:54
12/26	1:00
12/29	9:42
12/29	9:48
12/29	21:30
12/29	23:18
12/29	23:24
12/29	23:48
12/30	0:06
12/30	15:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
11/4	10:06
11/21	21:30
12/14	23:24
12/14	23:30
12/14	23:36
12/14	23:42
12/14	23:48
12/14	23:54
12/15	3:54
12/17	13:30
12/17	13:42

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Fourth Quarter 2010	
12/17	13:48
12/17	13:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - First Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/11	2:54
1/11	3:06
1/19	17:00
1/20	1:54
1/30	21:06
2/3	0:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/1	5:24
1/3	12:48
1/7	3:00
1/7	3:12
1/7	3:18
1/7	3:24
1/7	3:30
1/7	10:36
1/15	22:54
1/20	2:00
2/21	11:42

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - First Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/4	2:18
1/4	2:24
3/20	20:12
3/20	20:18
3/21	14:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2011	
---	--

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/13	9:00
1/13	12:42
1/17	22:54
1/17	23:30
1/18	0:12
1/18	0:18
1/18	0:36
1/29	10:30
2/1	13:54
2/24	20:12
2/24	20:18
3/5	6:12
3/25	1:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Second Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
5/5	10:06
5/5	20:06
6/17	12:36
6/17	12:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Second Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/27	3:54
4/27	4:06
4/27	4:12
4/27	4:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Second Quarter 2011	

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Second Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
6/24	21:36
6/27	18:42
6/27	18:48
6/27	18:54
6/27	19:54
6/30	6:42
6/30	8:30

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Second Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/27	21:06
4/27	21:18
4/27	21:24
5/5	15:06
6/5	13:42
6/5	22:18
6/5	22:24
6/12	7:30
6/22	0:36
6/22	0:42
6/22	0:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Third Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
7/12	23:18
7/12	23:24
7/25	13:12

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Third Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
8/9	12:54
8/15	3:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Third Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
7/2	2:24
7/2	2:30
7/8	4:48
7/8	4:54
7/20	13:18
7/25	22:12
9/9	23:30
9/13	17:12

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Third Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
7/31	7:18
7/31	8:18
7/31	8:24
8/21	3:36
8/21	3:42
9/3	13:30

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Third Quarter 2011	
9/3	13:36
9/12	22:18
9/12	22:24
9/12	22:30

:

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Fourth Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/9	18:48
10/13	6:48
10/13	6:54
11/10	19:48
11/12	10:54
11/17	15:54
11/22	1:18
11/28	14:30
12/1	4:24
12/2	23:36
12/6	10:12
12/6	23:48
12/9	13:24
12/10	3:00
12/12	9:12
12/17	23:12
12/18	3:12
12/27	9:42
12/27	12:12
12/28	16:54
12/29	15:12
12/30	11:12

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - Fourth Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/17	9:48

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Fourth Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/3	0:30
11/23	17:12
11/23	17:30
12/9	23:12

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Fourth Quarter 2011	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
10/5	3:36
10/5	3:42
10/10	21:06
10/16	12:36
11/25	22:00
11/29	20:00
12/17	15:54
12/23	4:30
12/23	4:48
12/23	5:12
12/25	18:24

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - First Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
2/1	23:06
2/5	23:54
2/23	12:24

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 2 - First Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/2	23:48
3/1	18:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - First Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
2/25	1:36
2/25	9:48
3/31	8:54

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
1/13	11:18
1/13	11:24
1/13	11:30
1/13	11:36
1/13	12:18
1/13	12:36
1/13	16:36
1/21	17:24
1/24	2:24
1/24	2:36
1/24	2:42

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - First Quarter 2012	
3/1	20:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 1 - Second Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
5/29	20:18

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 3 - Second Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
4/3	10:48
4/3	10:54
4/7	22:36
4/7	22:42
4/7	23:42
4/28	11:36
6/3	4:06
6/3	4:12
6/3	4:18
6/3	4:24
6/5	6:54
6/5	10:18
6/5	10:30
6/5	10:42
6/5	10:48
6/5	10:54
6/5	15:18
6/7	7:00
6/7	7:06

Colstrip Opacity Violations - Unit 4 - Second Quarter 2012	
Date	Time (24 hour clock)
5/2	7:06
5/2	7:12
5/3	5:18
5/4	6:54
6/6	12:54
6/7	6:54
6/23	10:18
6/23	10:24
6/23	10:30
6/23	13:54
6/23	21:36
6/23	21:42